Costs of healthcare acquired infections due to inadequate water, sanitation and hygiene (WASH) in healthcare facilities in Mali

Summary

The number of healthcare associated infections (HAI) in Mali (population: 22.6 million) is conservatively estimated at 51,000 cases in 2022, with 5,300 excess deaths in a year. The increasing rate of antimicrobial resistance causes worse health outcomes and higher costs of treating HAIs. Monetary estimates were aggregated from the healthcare costs, the productivity losses and the premature deaths associated with HAIs, including antimicrobial resistance. The total economic costs of HAIs in Mali in 2022 is US$ 73 million. This equates with 0.39% of Gross Domestic Product in 2022. The financial costs of providing healthcare to treat HAIs is US$ 73 million in 2022, or 2.5% of total health expenditure. When comparing the medical costs per capita in Mali of US$ 0.91 per year with the cost per capita needed to provide basic water, sanitation and hygiene (WASH), waste management and environmental cleaning in healthcare facilities in low-income countries (US$ 0.3 per capita for capital cost and starting at US$ 0.7 recurrent cost) it is highly likely that the spending will be more than covered by the savings in medical costs.

In addition to HAIs, cleanliness, availability of drinking water and a clean toilet are key determinants of patient satisfaction. These aspects are particularly important to people when they are at their most vulnerable, such as during surgery, during labour and delivery, and neonates in the first moments of their lives. Experiences of poor quality of care and inconvenience can impact future treatment-seeking behaviour and they also impact healthcare worker job satisfaction and absenteeism. Implementing WASH and infection prevention and control (IPC) should be essential interventions implemented by the health sector in Mali to reduce HAIs and improve the quality of healthcare and patient satisfaction across the country.

Key messages

• The total economic costs of healthcare associated infections (HAI) in Mali in 2022 was US$ 73 million.
• This equates with 0.4% of Gross Domestic Product.
• The financial costs of providing healthcare to treat HAIs is US$ 21 million in 2022, or 2.5% of total health expenditure.
• It is feasible that the spending to provide basic WASH, waste management and environmental cleaning in healthcare facilities in Mali (less than US$ 1 per capita) will be balanced by savings in medical costs of US$ 0.46 per capita per year, if the HAI rate can be halved.

The lack of adequate water, sanitation and hygiene (WASH), waste management and environmental cleanliness in healthcare facilities poses a significant health risk to patients and healthcare workers in Mali, and it seriously impacts quality of care and satisfaction with health services.

In Mali there are tens of thousands of healthcare associated infections (HAI) each year, and thousands of resulting deaths. These infections impact patients, their families and healthcare facilities by causing illness, prolonged hospital stays, potential disability, excess costs and sometimes death. Furthermore, HAI s affect people when they are at their most vulnerable – during surgery, women during pregnancy, labor and delivery, and neonates in the first moments of their lives.

The problem caused by HAI s has been recognised by the Ministry of Health in Mali, which has taken steps to improve infection prevention and control (IPC). In partnership with international financial partners, including WHO, UNICEF, Intrahealth and USAID, a series of documents were developed in 2020 including a revised national IPC guideline, a facilitator’s guide, a participant’s manual, and work tools, grouped together in a toolkit. This toolkit has also been adapted for use in the context of the COVID-19 pandemic and is one of the reference documents for IPC/COVID-19 training in the country. The e-learning platforms on infection prevention and control were launched in the country in February 2021 (MTaPS, 2021). Furthermore, the Revised Infection Prevention & Control Plan & Waste Management was prepared under the World Bank’s Mali COVID-19 Emergency Response Project (P173816) (The World Bank, 2020).

A growing proportion of HAI s are resistant to antimicrobials, leading to a worse health outcome for the patient and making them more costly to treat and requiring longer to recover and restart normal life, including productive activities. Antimicrobial resistance (AMR) rates vary across drugs and across settings within Mali, but available estimates suggest that the majority of HAI s will be resistant to first-line drugs.

As a response, Mali has issued a National Action Plan (NAP) for Antimicrobial Use and Resistance in 2018. An operational plan and a detailed plan for M&E of the NAP on AMR implementation exists. The national AMR surveillance system includes five sentinel sites that reported to WHO GLASS during the 2019, 2020 and 2021 data calls. Review of progress has been published by WHO (WHO, 2022).

The major transmission pathway for HAI s is a lack of cleanliness and hygiene measures provided during medical care and recovery time. The most common HAI s are surgical site infections, bloodstream infections, and respiratory tract infections, including pneumonia. The highest rates are found in intensive care units (ICUs), neonatal wards or ICUs, and pediatric medical wards. Some HAI s originate in the endogenous native microflora of the patients themselves, and hence cause infection following surgery or catheter-associated urinary tract infections.

Figure 1 shows data compiled by the WHO/UNICEF Joint Monitoring Programme (JMP) for WASH in healthcare facilities in Mali. Compared to rural data, coverage for urban areas is limited in Mali. There is also insufficient data for national estimates for hygiene and environmental cleaning, whilst for sanitation and water it is limited. In rural areas basic cleaning takes place in less than 18% of healthcare facilities. The majority, 95%, of rural healthcare facilities only have a limited sanitation service. Basic water supply is available in 82% of rural healthcare facilities. Handwashing materials at point of care are available in 42% of rural healthcare facilities. Basic waste management is available in at least 50% of healthcare facilities nationally.

---
1. An HAI is a condition resulting from an adverse reaction to an infectious agent or its toxins acquired from healthcare settings that was not incubating or symptomatic at the time of admission.
Figure 1. Coverage of WASH, waste management and environmental cleaning in healthcare facilities in Mali in 2021

Methods

This study uses a cost-of-illness methodology developed for a recent World Bank study on the costs of HAIs in nine countries of Eastern and Southern Africa. See Hutton et al., (2023) where full methods and data sources are available. A quantitative model was constructed to estimate (1) healthcare costs, (2) patients’ productivity losses, and (3) mortality costs due to HAIs in Mali, including additional costs of treating antimicrobial resistant infections. Variables and data inputs are summarised in Table 1. The calculations are as follows:

- **Healthcare costs**: the number of HAIs across three health facility levels (health centre, district hospital and higher-level hospital such as regional, referral or teaching hospital), multiplied by the average cost per inpatient day at each level, multiplied by the average length of stay, and with the total drug cost per HAI added.

- **Productivity costs**: (a) the number of HAIs multiplied by the proportion of adults working multiplied by the daily opportunity cost of time (proxied by the agricultural wage), plus (b) the number of HAIs multiplied by the proportion of patients not working (including children) multiplied by the daily opportunity cost of time for non-working people (30% of the daily GDP per capita). All calculations are made separately for male and female.

- **Mortality costs**: the number of deaths due to HAIs (the number of HAIs multiplied by the excess case fatality rate due to HAIs) multiplied by the value of life.

### Table 1. Variables, data needs and sources for damage cost estimation of HAIs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cost variable</th>
<th>Data needs</th>
<th>Mali data value (in brackets range used in sensitivity analysis)</th>
<th>Data source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Healthcare cost</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annual healthcare associated infections (HAIs)</td>
<td>Average % of admissions infected with HAI</td>
<td>12.76% (10.3% to 15.2%)</td>
<td>Abubakar et al (2022), Boucourn et al (2019), Togo et al (2010)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Proportion of anti-microbial resistance in HAIs</td>
<td>50% (25% to 75%)</td>
<td>Bocoum et al (2019), Murray et al (2022)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No. of annual hospital admissions</td>
<td>1.78 admissions per 100 population</td>
<td>République de Mali (2023)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Additional cost of treating a patient with an HAI</strong></td>
<td>Average hospital cost per day (‘hotel’ cost)</td>
<td>US$ 17.6 health centre, US$ 16.0 district hospital, US$ 29.8 higher hospital</td>
<td>IHME (2015)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cost of drugs and laboratory tests per HAI</td>
<td>US$ 27.0 health centre, US$ 64.6 district hospital, US$ 296.9 higher hospital</td>
<td>Aerts et al (2022), Gidey et al (2023), Bocoum et al (2019)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Several impacts were excluded due to lack of data and lack of methods to quantify in monetary values. Hence, the estimates presented in this study will significantly underestimate the true economic and social costs of HAIs in Mali.

Notes: See Annex 1.

---

2. For example, unoccupied beds due to isolation (loss of capacity and revenue), extended length of stay in an intensive care unit (ICU), non-standard surgical prophylaxis in infected patients, infection prevention and control interventions such as screening at hospital admission or before surgery, long-term consequences of AMR infection, training of healthcare professionals and communication, HAIs of healthcare workers. Out-of-pocket expenditures by patients and their carers were also excluded. Financial burden on the government such as disability benefits were excluded.

3. No comprehensive study of the economic and financial costs of HAIs has been conducted anywhere in the world, so it is not possible to conclude by how much this current study underestimates the true costs of HAIs.

---

### Cost variable | Data needs | Mali data value (in brackets range used in sensitivity analysis) | Data source
---|---|---|---
**Productivity cost**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Annual HAIs</th>
<th>Same as Healthcare cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Additional days for recovery after HAI</td>
<td>Additional recovery time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loss in value-added of workers</td>
<td>Productivity loss (value-added in agriculture)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Proportion of adult HAI patients</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Labour force participation rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Proportion of HAIs suffered by women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loss of time spent in non-productive activities (opportunity cost)</td>
<td>Average daily value</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Mortality cost**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Annual HAIs</th>
<th>Same as Healthcare cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Case fatality rate</td>
<td>HAI case fatality rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value of a premature death</td>
<td>Value of a statistical life</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Results

Disease burden due to healthcare associated infections

In total, the average number of HAIs in Mali is estimated to be 51,000 in 2022 (Figure 2), of which half are predicted to be antimicrobial resistant (Berhe et al. 2021; Murray et al. 2022). The number of fatalities resulting from these HAIs is estimated to be 5,300 deaths.

Figure 2. Estimated number of healthcare associated infections and related deaths in Mali

Estimates were made using different data inputs. When varying the baseline HAI rate of 12.8% from 10.3% to 15.2%, the number of HAIs varied from 41,000 to 61,000. When varying the AMR rate (baseline 50%) from 25% to 75%, the number of HAIs that are anti-microbial resistant varies from 13,000 to 38,000. When varying the case fatality rate (baseline 6.9%) from 4% to 15%, the number of deaths varies from 3,100 to 11,500.
Monetary impacts due to HAIs

Costs of HAI are presented in Figure 3. Total costs exceed US$ 73 million per year in Mali.

Figure 3. Estimated costs from HAIs in Mali

Healthcare costs amount to US$ 21 million per year, with US$5 million in productivity losses and US$ 48 million in lost lives. The costs of premature death account for 66% of the total costs, due to the relatively high case fatality rate from HAIs. Total cost per HAI is US$ 1,429. Healthcare cost averaged US$ 401 per HAI episode.

Costs as a proportion of GDP and healthcare spending are shown in Figure 4. In terms of economic cost, HAIs cost an equivalent 0.4% of GDP. The costs of treating HAIs (US$ 21 million per year) reflect 2.5% of overall healthcare spending from all sources.

Figure 4. Costs as a proportion of GDP and healthcare spending
**Sensitivity analysis**

To better understand the impact of uncertain data inputs on the results, the values of selected variables were altered one at a time to assess what impact would be on the overall results in terms of economic impact. The variables selected include the HAI rate, the AMR rate, the average length of hospital stay, the value of time, the value of death, the case fatality rate. The results are shown in Figure 5. The biggest impact is the value of statistical life (VSL) which when a higher value was used it led to a total economic cost of US$ 212 billion in 2022. The results were also sensitive to the case fatality rate and the HAI rate. The resulting impact on costs as a percent of GDP were from 0.28% (low data value for CFR rate) to 1.12% (high value for VSL).

**Figure 5. Results of sensitivity analysis**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>HAI low</th>
<th>HAI high</th>
<th>AMR low</th>
<th>AMR high</th>
<th>ALOS low</th>
<th>ALOS high</th>
<th>Time value low</th>
<th>Time value high</th>
<th>CFR low</th>
<th>CFR high</th>
<th>VSL high</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Healthcare cost</td>
<td>$50 million</td>
<td>$60 million</td>
<td>$40 million</td>
<td>$50 million</td>
<td>$30 million</td>
<td>$40 million</td>
<td>$20 million</td>
<td>$25 million</td>
<td>$10 million</td>
<td>$15 million</td>
<td>$20 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Productivity cost</td>
<td>$20 million</td>
<td>$25 million</td>
<td>$15 million</td>
<td>$20 million</td>
<td>$10 million</td>
<td>$15 million</td>
<td>$5 million</td>
<td>$7.5 million</td>
<td>$3 million</td>
<td>$4.5 million</td>
<td>$6 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mortality cost</td>
<td>$30 million</td>
<td>$35 million</td>
<td>$25 million</td>
<td>$30 million</td>
<td>$20 million</td>
<td>$25 million</td>
<td>$10 million</td>
<td>$12.5 million</td>
<td>$7 million</td>
<td>$8.5 million</td>
<td>$10 million</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Cost-benefit analysis**

The financial cost per capita to the health system due to HAIs across all the Malian population is at least US$ 0.91 each year. Comparing this conservative figure with the cost per capita needed to provide basic WASH, waste management and environmental cleaning in healthcare facilities in low-income countries (US$ 0.3 per capita for capital cost and starting at US$ 0.7 recurrent cost) it is highly feasible that the spending will be covered by the savings in medical costs (Chaitkin et al, 2022).
Conclusions

HAIs and other impacts of inadequate WASH are key challenges that need to be urgently addressed to achieve progress towards universal healthcare. Hospitals and health centres should be seen as safe environments where people can go to overcome illness and heal fully, and not places to get even sicker and stay for longer than necessary. At least 1.25% of healthcare expenditures could be saved if HAIs were minimised.

As has been found in richer nations, it is difficult to eliminate HAIs altogether, but significant reductions can be achieved through targeted interventions as well as improved general training and healthcare practices. Therefore, WASH and IPC measures should be essential interventions implemented by the health sector in Mali to reduce HAIs and improve the quality of healthcare and patient satisfaction across the country.
References


Abubakar et al (2022) provides a pooled estimate for HAIs, estimating 12.76% (95% confidence interval 10.30–15.23), based on 15 eligible Africa studies. It was found that surgical site infection was the most common HAI and accounted for 41.6% of all HAIs, followed by bloodstream infection and respiratory tract infections/pneumonia. In Mali, Bocoum et al (2019) conducted a study in the gynecology-obstetrics department of CHU Gabriel Touré in 2016. 23 out of 138 patients (11.50%) who were operated had bacterial infection associated with care. The most common types of infection were surgical site infection (60.9%), urinary tract infection (26.1%), endometritis and sepsis with 13.0% each. Also in Mali, Togo et al (2010) conducted a study in the General Surgery Department of the Teaching Hospital Gabriel Toure in Bamako on the diagnosis of nosocomial infections in 2007. 44 of 460 patients (9.6%) were affected by nosocomial infections. These included 31 cases of surgical site infections (57.4%), 9 cases of infections on burns (16.7%), 7 cases of lung infections (13%), and 7 cases of urinary tract infections (13%). The most frequently isolated bacteria were Escherichia coli (44%).

Based on the stronger evidence from the pooled estimates, it is appropriate to use the pooled estimates reported in the meta-analysis by Abubakar et al (2022).

In Mali, Bocoum et al (2019), isolated organisms were all resistant to Amoxicillin, to Amoxicillin + Clavulanic acid (88.9%) and to Ciprofloxacin (77.8%). Togo et al (2010) found that all isolated bacteria were resistant to amoxicillin and 46% were sensitive to ciprofloxacin.

Murray et al (2022) report a systematic analysis of the global burden of bacterial antimicrobial resistance in 2019 and produce modelled estimates for resistance of several important pathogens to frontline drugs. From Murray et al, 2022, rates of resistance are the following for Mali:

- Meticillin-resistant Staphylococcus aureus is 10-20%.
- Isoniazid and rifampicin co-resistant (excluding XDR) Mycobacterium tuberculosis is <5%.
- Third-generation cephalosporin-resistant Escherichia coli is 30-40%.
- Carbapenem-resistant Acinetobacter baumannii is 20-30%.
- Fluoroquinolone-resistant Escherichia coli is 50-60%.
- Carbapenem-resistant Klebsiella pneumoniae is <5%.
- Third-generation cephalosporin-resistant Klebsiella pneumoniae is >80%.

due to lack of published data available on the total costs of treating HAIs, it is necessary to construct the cost based on the cost per hospital bed day, the additional length of stay due to HAI, and the costs of drugs, procedures and laboratory tests related to the HAI. AMR will also lead to longer length of stay, and additional costs of drugs, procedures and laboratory tests.

The cost per bed day in 2022 is estimated using the 2011 cost in Uganda (IHME, 2014), updating to current prices using the GDP deflator for Uganda for 11 years, and then converting to West African CFA using the average exchange rate for 2022.

Aerts et al (2022) for Mozambique, Gigey et al (2023) for Ethiopia and Bocoum et al (2019) for Mali, reflecting three ranges for different levels of care. Values in local currency were updated to 2022.
costs and converted to West Africa CFA using PPP. In Mali, Bocoum et al (2019) found the average cost of management of patients who developed the surgical site infection was 119,837 FCFA (US$201 at 2016 exchange rate).

Based on data, as follows. Fenny et al (2020) found in a teaching hospital additional average length of stay (ALOS) of 4.6 days for patients with SSI. Otieku et al (2023) found ALOS was 3 days longer between the HAI (non-AMR) group and the control group. In Mali, Bocoum et al (2019) report the average duration of hospitalization for patients who developed infection was 14.7 days.

Otieku et al (2023) found patients in the AMR cohort stayed approximately 5 more days compared with HAI patients and 8 more days compared with uninfected cohorts.

An exploratory literature review with a focus on the nine countries of the Hutton et al (2023) study found seven studies. Two studies presented case fatality of only HAI patients, while five compared HAI and non-HAI patients. Differences in case fatality ranged from 4.2% to 14.6%, with two studies from Ethiopia with a difference of 6.9%.

US$ 8 million value of statistical life (VSL) from the USA (Banzhaf, 2022) converted to Mali based on GDP per capita differential with the USA and using an income elasticity of 1.5. The high value is estimated using an income elasticity of 1.2.
WaterAid is an international not-for-profit, determined to make clean water, decent toilets and good hygiene normal for everyone, everywhere within a generation. Only by tackling these three essentials in ways that last can people change their lives for good.